

Roseann Buchner
buchnerr@eurekacityschools.org
TAH 2

Raphael Teaching American History-Lesson Plan

Topic: Molly Pitcher -- "Out of Many, One"

Theme: Sometimes stories are molded to create an ideal individual.

National History Standards:

Historical Thinking Standards for Grades K-4:

*Standard 1 Chronological Thinking

1B-Identify the temporal structure of a historical narrative or story.

1C-Establish temporal order in constructing students' own historical narratives.

*Standard 2 Historical Comprehension

2H-Draw upon the visual data presented in photographs, paintings, cartoons, and architectural drawings.

*Standard 3 Historical Analysis and Interpretation

3B-Compare and contrast differing sets of ideas, values, personalities, behaviors, and institutions.

3C-Analyze historical fiction.

3D-Distinguish between fact and fiction.

*Standard 4 Historical Research Capabilities

4b-Obtain historical data.

Standards in History K-4:

Topic 3: The History of the United States

Standard 4b-The student understands ordinary people who have exemplified values and principles of American democracy.

Standard 4C-The student understands historic figures who have exemplified values and principles of American democracy.

Standard 6A-The student understands folklore and other cultural contributions from various regions of the United States and how they help to form a national heritage.

California History-Social Science Standards:

K.4 Students compare and contrast the locations of people, places, and environments and describe their characteristics.

K.4.2. Distinguish between land and water on maps and globes and locate general areas referenced in historical legends and stories.

K.6 Students understand that history relates to events, people, and places of other times.

K.6.3. Understand how people lived in earlier times and how their lives would be different today (e.g., getting water from a well, growing food, making clothing, having fun, forming organizations, living by rules and laws).

1.4 Students compare and contrast everyday life in different times and places around the world and recognize that some aspects of people, places, and things change over time while others stay the same.

1.4.3 Recognize similarities and differences of earlier generations in such areas as work (inside and outside the home), dress, manners, stories, games, and festivals, drawing from biographies, oral histories, and folklore.

2.1 Students differentiate between things that happened long ago and things that happened yesterday. 2.5 Students understand the importance of individual action and character and explain how heroes from long ago and the recent past have made a difference in others' lives (e.g., from biographies of Abraham Lincoln, Louis Pasteur, Sitting Bull, George Washington Carver, Marie Curie, Albert Einstein, Golda Meir, Jackie Robinson, Sally Ride).

3.1 Students describe the physical and human geography and use maps, tables, graphs, photographs, and charts to organize information about people, places, and environments in a spatial context.

Timeline: This lesson is designed to take 2 days. Day 1 is an informational day. Day 2 involves using the information from Day 1 to produce a product. This lesson is part of a larger unit centering on the American Revolution.

Materials Needed:

*Overhead of "Molly Pitcher at the Battle of Monmouth" engraving

<http://www.gilderlehrman.org/htdig/htsearch.cgi?config=&restrict=&exclude=&method=and&format=builtin-long&sort=score&words=Molly+Pitcher&x=16&y=17>

*map of American Revolution battles

<http://www.dean.usma.edu/history/web03/atlas/american%20revolution/american%20revolution%20pages/ar%20overview%20map.htm>

*chart paper

*markers

*writing paper

*optional, clear vinyl to cover US Map (available at fabric stores), water based markers

Prior Content Knowledge and Skills:

*Content: Students will need basic background knowledge about events leading to the American Revolution. In the primary elementary grades we're talking about general information on key events such as: the Proclamation of 1763, the Revenue Acts (1764), the Stamp Act (1765), the Townshend Act (1767), the Boston Massacre (1770), and the Boston Tea Party (1773). Students should have a basic understanding of the political region making up the United States at that time. They will use listening skills to gather information from class discussion, need to know how to form a story map, and how to use basic writing skills in order to produce a story (friendly letter).

*Skills: The primary document used in this lesson is an engraving by J.C.

Armytage of "Molly Pitcher at the Battle of Monmouth" available at the GilderLehrman site (www.gilderlehrman.org). Search for "Molly Pitcher". Or, you

could type in the following:

<http://www.gilderlehrman.org/htdig/htsearch.cgi?config=&restrict=&exclude=&method=and&format=builtin-long&sort=score&words=Molly+Pitcher&x=16&y=17>

They will also use a map which shows the major battles of the Revolutionary War. (See the map found at the following address:

<http://www.dean.usma.edu/history/web03/atlasses/american%20revolution/american%20revolution%20pages/ar%20overview%20map.htm> or borrow a social

studies book from a fifth grade teacher and locate a map of the key battles of the American Revolution.

DAY 1:

Introductory "Hook":

Show the student the engraving by J.C. Armytage of "Molly Pitcher at the Battle of Monmouth."

<http://www.gilderlehrman.org/htdig/htsearch.cgi?config=&restrict=&exclude=&method=and&format=builtin-long&sort=score&words=Molly+Pitcher&x=16&y=17>

Tell them: This is a piece of artwork depicting a scene from the Revolutionary War. There is something "wrong" with this picture.

Ask them: What do you think is "wrong" with the picture?

Have the students think-pair-share what they think is "wrong."

Think...give them 3 minutes to visually analyze the artwork individually.

Pair....have them share their ideas with a partner.

Share....have a class discussion about what the class feels is "wrong" with the scene. Make a list of student responses. (The most likely response is that women wouldn't be loading cannons.)

Lesson Content:

Ask them: What role do you think women played in the American Revolution?

Tell them: During the American Revolution there were many battles.

Show them: Plot the major battle areas on a map using the following map for reference:

<http://www.dean.usma.edu/history/web03/atlasses/american%20revolution/american%20revolution%20pages/ar%20overview%20map.htm> (I like to use a clear

piece of vinyl...available at most fabric stores...as an overlay on our pull-down US map. They are familiar with this map and can more readily visualize where in space items are located on this map. Battle locations can be plotted using a water-based pen.) Ask them: If these are just the key battlefields, and many more battles were fought, do you think many people would be influenced? Might some of those people be women? Or, even children? Tell them: Women were involved in many ways. They served as camp followers, nurses, and sometimes as soldiers.

*Camp followers cooked and laundered for the troops, melted lead and made ammunition, carried water, and delivered messages. *Nurses kept wounds clean, fed the wounded, and did what they could to keep a clean atmosphere in a war situation. *Soldiers....Some women disguised themselves as men and served in the military. Most of the women that fought in battle fought when their fort or

stronghold was under attack, and then returned to their regular duties following battle. Ask them: What character traits would these women exhibit?
With them: Brainstorm and formulate a list of character traits for each of the three categories of involvement. Ask them: Would these character traits be desirable in military situations today? Show them: The Armytage artwork again. Ask them: Do you want to know what's wrong with this picture? Tell them: The women in the picture isn't real. Her actions could have been carried out by a women during the American Revolution.....but Molly Pitcher is a fictitious character.

DAY 2:

Lesson Content:

Review with them: Yesterday we talked about the roles women played in the American Revolution....review the lists made yesterday. Ask them: Do you remember what was wrong with the picture we saw yesterday? Tell them: Sometimes stories are molded to create an ideal individual (our theme). When talking about history it is important to note real events as accurately as possible. When we look at historical fiction we are seeing stories that are based upon facts, or factual events, but key characters are often invented in order to make a "better" story...or to make a story that sends a message that the author intends. Historical fiction is great...as long as the audience knows that a portion is fiction.

Conclusion:

Ask them: Why would someone, or even a group of people make up a story if real instances of participation exist? We know of some real people, i.e. Deborah Sampson, so why would someone make up a character like Molly Pitcher? (To make a "better", or more interesting story!) Tell them: Other reasons people will make up stories might include notoriety, or for tourism purposes. Ask them: Have you ever stretched the truth to make a "better" story?

Evaluation:

Traditional Form....

List three ways that women served in the Revolutionary War. List five character traits that would be beneficial for a women serving in a war. Write about what way(s) historical fiction is a good way to tell a story. Write about what way(s) historical fiction might be a bad way to tell a story.

Creative Form....

Write a letter. In this letter you are a woman in the American Revolution. You will include information in the letter so that the reader knows what your role is (camp follower, nurse, soldier), what your responsibilities are, and how you are feeling about your role/responsibilities. Make sure to let the reader know your setting (chose one of the key battle areas from our map.) Start by producing a story map. Use this map to write your letter. Be sure to include all 5 elements of a Friendly Letter.

Deborah Dukes

TAH 2 -- Lesson Plan for Ray Raphael, Chapter 2 -
Grade 8
May 8, 2004

Out of Many, One: The Stories of All the Molly Pitchers

Theme: Sometimes stories of real-life people are changed to fit idealized concepts.

Topic: Molly Pitcher and her role in the American Revolution

Standards: National Standards for History -
Historical Thinking (Grades 5 - 12)

Standard 2 Historical Comprehension

A. Draw upon visual, literary, and musical sources.

Standard 3 Historical Analysis and Interpretation

A. Identify the author or source of the historical document or narrative.

B. Compare and contrast differing sets of ideas, values, personalities, behaviors, and institutions.

C. Differentiate between historical facts and historical interpretation.

D. Consider multiple perspectives.

E. Analyze cause-and-effect relationships and multiple causation, including the importance of the individual, the influence of ideas, and the role of chance.

G. Compare competing historical narratives.

H. Hold interpretations of history as tentative.

I. Evaluate major debates among historians.

J. Hypothesize the influence of the past.

Standard 4 Historical Analysis and Interpretation

D. Identify the gaps in the available records, marshal contextual knowledge and perspectives of the time and place, and construct a sound historical interpretation.

California History - Social Science Standards

8.4.4 Discuss daily life, including traditions in art, music, and literature of early national America (e.g., through writings by Washington Irving, James Fenimore Cooper).

8.6.5 Trace the development of the American education system from its earliest roots, including the roles of religious and private schools and Horace Mann's campaign for free public education and its assimilating role in American culture.

8.6.6 Examine the women's suffrage movement (e.g., biographies, writings, and speeches of Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Margaret Fuller, Lucretia Mott, Susan B. Anthony).

For comparison with what students have already been taught:

5.6.3 Identify the different roles women played during the Revolution (e.g., Abigail Adams, Martha Washington, Molly Pitcher, Phillis Wheatley, Mercy Otis Warren). [bold-face emphasis is lesson plan author's]

This would be a good lesson for any time period from the American Revolution to Seneca Falls in 1848. It could also be the basis for Language Arts lessons on evaluating an author's sources and intent.

Timeline: 2 one-hour periods

Teacher Preparation:

- * Copies of Ray Raphael's Chapter 2: MOLLY PITCHER, enough for each student or group.

- * Two copies of any of several heroic Molly Pitcher paintings (china pitcher, flowing skirts, rosy cheeks, fallen husband, etc.), one fastened to the top of a puzzle box, one cut into as many puzzle pieces as real life models for Molly Pitcher that you use.

<http://teachpol.tenj.edu/amerpol/hist/fi/00000032.htm>

or

<http://www.cbsd.org/pennsylvaniapeople/level1>

biographies/images/Molly%20Pitcher.jpg

- * 4x6 unlined index cards, one for each group, each with a puzzle piece shape drawn on one side (see examples below).

- * A picture of a beautiful model or movie star, fastened to the top of a puzzle box.

* Copies of pictures of other people (your students, teachers, or any other group of people who do not necessarily conform to the current standards of beauty represented by the picture on the box), cut into random puzzle pieces.

* Copies of a short, standard “biography” of Molly Pitcher, such as that found at the United States Army Field Artillery Association:

<http://sill-www.army.mil/pao/pamolly.htm>

* Copies of biographical information on women who have been associated with the Molly Pitcher legend. Some internet links to short biographies of some of these women are listed in the bibliography at the end of this lesson plan, as a start to more comprehensive research, if desired. The subjects of these biographies tend to be relatively unknown, and I was able to find readily-available printed (as opposed to web-based) biographical information on only a couple of the most well-known, and that was not in a middle school library. Using the websites, though, could provide discussion material about relative accuracy of stories, based on primary source documentation, etc. See the discussion points at the end of the lesson plan.

Prior knowledge and skills: The students should be able to read short biographical articles preselected and made available by the teacher. They should have a very general background in Revolutionary War history and gender roles of the eras discussed. If students have a familiarity with the concept of primary sources, they will be much more prepared to understand and discuss Raphael’s argument that Molly Pitcher is a myth.

Introductory “Hook”: Have Kate Wolf’s song, “Picture Puzzle” (or any other song where the lyrics are understandable as relating to puzzle pieces not fitting) playing as they enter the room and settle down. (Lesson plan author’s note: I could not find free copies of the lyrics on the internet, but the song is on at least three of Wolf’s CDs: Lines on the Paper, Give Yourself to Love, and An Evening in

Austin, all available in stores, online and perhaps in local public libraries.)

Have pictures of ordinary people cut up into random jigsaw-style pieces and all mixed together in a box with a beautiful model on the cover. Give every student a few puzzle pieces and ask them to re-create the picture on the box. Of course it can't be done.

Discuss what parts of the ordinary people might correspond to the model. For instance, different people might have the same color hair, eyes, be tall, be thin, etc. Be careful to keep it positive, and to emphasize that we all correspond in some way -- two eyes, nice smile, student status, etc.

Day 1 Show the students the Early American Archives' first person slide show of the traditional Molly Pitcher story.

http://earlyamerica.com/molly_pitcher.html

Then ask them to read the short story of Molly Pitcher from one of several websites, or print it out ahead of time to distribute to the students to read. The United States Field Artillery Association version is a particularly succinct, heroic retelling.

<http://sill-www.army.mil/pao/pamolly.htm>

Ask the students to read the Raphael chapter, comparing and contrasting it mentally with the standard "biography" they just read.

Divide them into four to six groups, being sure to have enough groups that all of the puzzle pieces are distributed. Assign each group a woman whose experiences or characteristics contributed to the Molly Pitcher story: Mary Ludwig Hays McCauley, Margaret Corbin (Captain Molly or Dirty Kate), Deborah Sampson, Moll Dimond Pitcher, Augustina Zaragoza (Maid of Saragossa), Anna Maria Lane, Elizabeth Canning, and any others you may find. Using biographical information from Raphael's chapter, prepared ahead of time by the teacher, or read from websites the teacher has pre-selected, ask each group to read about their assigned woman, making group notes of their subject's experiences or characteristics that either conform to the idealized Molly Pitcher or that deviate from that idea.

Day 2 Distribute a 4x6 unlined index card to each group. It should have one of the puzzle pieces

matching the box lid Molly Pitcher fastened on one side, with the same piece outlined on the back of the card. Instruct them to use the puzzle piece shaped outline on the back to compare (within the puzzle piece outline) and contrast (outside the line) their subject with the mythical Molly Pitcher. For instance, “alcoholic” and “camp follower” would be noted outside the puzzle outline, while “female” and “drew army pension” would be inside the outline on the back of the puzzle piece.

Have them cut away the rough edges - in both senses of the term - to leave only the Molly Pitcher myth information. This should result in a puzzle piece that fits with the other groups' pieces to recreate the idealized Molly Pitcher picture from the box cover.

Either within their groups or as a class, discuss what they discovered in their subject's character that kept her from being an ideal character. Discuss superheroes, athletes, models, movie stars and other idealized characters whose flaws we do not see. A possibly apocryphal quote from supermodel Christy Brinkley might be a useful prompt here: “Even I don't look like Christy Brinkley when I wake up in the morning.”

The final discussion should revolve around the myth-breaking arguments in Raphael's chapter on Molly Pitcher. Possible discussion questions might include:

* Why is Molly's story strong and believable enough that she is still generating “nonfiction” biographies?

* Why is it still taught, despite the fact that it is a myth?

* Compare the biographies of your subjects with Raphael's accounts of them. Were the sources for the internet sites and children's biographies well documented? Was Raphael's chapter? What can you conclude from the degree of documentation? Which version do you think is closer to the truth? Why? Can you know for certain?

* Why do we need to model ourselves and our children on someone else?

* Why do we need our heroes to be perfect? Who decides what makes a perfect hero? Does the concept of “perfect” change over time, even in the same culture?

* Are ordinary, imperfect people ever heroes? How and when? What happens when we discover that someone who has done something heroic also swears and has nose hair, either metaphorically or in life?

* In what other ways do we idealize ordinary people?

Evaluation: If the teacher has circulated during the above discussion, making sure that everyone is involved in the process, the discussion may constitute the evaluation. If the discussion is not inclusive or comprehensive, assign written or oral work on the above discussion points.

Bibliography:

Pictures

http://earlyamerica.com/molly_pitcher.html

Archiving

Early America’s series, “Famous Moments in Early American History” features a slide show of heroic pictures of “Molly Pitcher: American Heroine” with first person voice-over.

<http://teachpol.tenj.edu/amerpolhist/fi/00000032.htm>

“Molly Pitcher at the Battle of Monmouth”, lithograph by Nathaniel Currier (downloadable)

<http://www.cbsd.org/pennsylvaniapeople/level1>

biographies/images/Molly%20Pitcher.jpg

“Molly Pitcher At The Gun”, no artist credit given (downloadable)

Traditional Stories of Molly Pitcher

Rockwell, Anne; illustrated by Cynthia von Buhler, They Called Her Molly Pitcher. Knopf, 2002. A picture book written for grades 1-3 that promotes Molly to a general’s wife.

Stevenson, Augusta, Molly Pitcher: Young Patriot (New York: Macmillan, 1986) A chapter book written at approximately third grade level, creating a childhood

for Molly Pitcher. One of the Childhood of Famous Americans series.

<http://sill-www.army.mil/pao/pamolly.htm> This biography is hyperlinked from many other Molly Pitcher sites, often cited as a primary source. It's the classic story, with striped skirts flying.

<http://www2.cr.nps.gov/abpp/Hidden/learnarcho.htm> The National Park Service's American Battlefield Protection Program shows a map of the Battle of Monmouth, with troop positions and the actual "lead canisters fired by Molly's four-pounder".

<http://www.americanrevwar.homestead.com/files/MOLLY.HTM> Biography of Molly Pitcher, including Currier's lithograph, an uncredited heroic picture, and an interesting toast.

Accounts of Women Who May Have Contributed to the Molly Pitcher Story

http://www.cbsd.org/pennsylvaniapeople/level2_biographies/Level_2_biographies/margaret_corbin_level_2.htm Biography of Margaret Corbin

http://www.cbsd.org/pennsylvaniapeople/level2_biographies/Level_2_biographies/mary_ludwig_hays_mccauley_level_2.htm Biography of Mary Ludwig Hays McCauley

<http://www.ushistory.org/valleyforge/youasked/070.htm> References to both Mary L.H. McCauley and Margaret Corbin as "Molly Pitcher".

<http://www.usigs.org/library/books/ma/Lynn1890/lynn02Ch2-1791.txt> Annals of Lynn (Massachusetts) Story of Moll Dimond Pitcher, who was well known throughout American and Europe as a fortune teller.

<http://www.thekreweofagustina.com/DesktopDefault.aspx?tabindex=1&tabid=5> Story of Agustina Zaragoza, the Maid of Saragossa, with statue and Lord Byron's poem.

<http://www.vahistorical.org/onthisday/2608.htm>

Virginia Historical Society's biography of Anna Maria Lane, who disguised herself as a man, so she could go with her husband. The accompanying picture shows her in woman's clothes, as a cannon matross.

http://www.rootsweb.com/~codcdar/new_page_1.htm

Biography of Deborah Sampson. Also mentions McCauley-Corbin sources for Molly Pitcher.

<http://www.muzzleblasts.com/Vol3No4/Articles/MB034-3.htm>

Margery Pepiot's biography of Margaret Corbin, aka "Captain Molly", with mention of Mary McCauley as "Molly Pitcher". Has Currier's lithograph of Molly Pitcher as illustration for Corbin story. Also has a picture of a saucy-looking young woman with striped skirt and uniform jacket.

Accounts Focusing on Composite Sources and Background

<http://www.minervacenter.com/faq.htm>

Linda Grant De

Pauw clearly states that Molly Pitcher is a legend, composed of often fictionalized details taken from several women.

<http://www.usfaa.com/awards/mollypitcher/>

United

States Field Artillery Association's biography, focusing on McCauley, but noting areas of controversy. "Carlisle (PA, McCauley's hometown) from the Molly Pitcher story."

<http://www.undelete.org/woa/woa10-13.html>

Irene

Stuber's apparently well documented account of the origins of the Molly Pitcher myth, with background about women in war and of a number of possible models for Molly Pitcher.